

GREEN MOUNTAIN ENGINEERING, INC.

*1438 South Brownell Road
P.O. Box 159 Williston, VT 05495
(802)862-5590 (Fax) 862-7598*

February 9, 2021

Mr. Josh Arneson, Town Manager
Town of Richmond, Vermont
P.O. Box 285
Richmond, Vermont 05477

RE: Bid Analysis and Recommendation for Contract Award
Richmond West Main Street – Water Main Replacement
GME Project No. 26-001

Dear Mr. Arneson:

Green Mountain Engineering, Inc. (GME) is pleased to provide the Bid Analysis and our Recommendation for Contract Award for the above referenced project. An advertisement for the project was sent out on January 8, 2021 to the list of construction firms having shown interest in the recent Bridge Street Infrastructure Project. In addition to directly contacting those construction firms, GME also advertised the project with “Works In Progress”, “Construction Connect” as well as “Construction Summary of New Hampshire/Maine and Vermont”. We have included a copy of the Bid advertisement for your records. This outreach resulted in eighteen (18)-separate firms contacting GME and expressing interest in the project (the list of firms is attached). Ten (10) of these firms submitted formal Bids as follows:

1. J. Hutchins, Inc.
2. DeBisschop Excavating
3. Desroches Construction Services, Inc.
4. Kirk Fenoff & Son Excavating LLC
5. Courtland Construction Corporation
6. Munson Earth Moving Corporation
7. All Seasons Excavating & Landscaping Inc.
8. Ormond Bushey & Sons Inc.
9. Dirt Tech Company LLC
10. Dubois Construction Inc.

All ten Bids were submitted to the Richmond Town Clerk’s Office prior to the 11 am deadline on February 5, 2021. Each bid was time and date stamped by the Town Clerk’s office at the time of submission and each envelope was sealed until officially opened. A public bid opening was subsequently conducted by GME and the Richmond Town Manager at the Town of Richmond offices. The bid opening was broadcast live via Zoom. Each bid submission was evaluated for inclusion of the following documents:

- Acknowledgment of the Date/Time received
- Verification of a fully completed and Signed Bid Form
- Verification of receipt of Addendum #1
- Verification of Bid Security

Following verification of the required bid items, each bid was then read publicly aloud. At the conclusion of that process, an apparent low bidder was announced. The apparent low bidder was J. Hutchins, Inc. of Richmond, Vermont with a total bid price of \$79,991.00. A copy of the bids are attached.

GME subsequently tabulated and carefully reviewed each written bid. Each bid form was checked for completeness, mathematical accuracy of each individual bid item as well as the bid total. All ten bids were determined to be complete and there were no mathematical errors of significance noted in any of the bids. One minor rounding error of was noted in Dirt Tech's Bid resulting in a difference of \$1.74 between the Bidders written Bid Total and GME's calculated Bid Total. The error did not however meaningfully affect the bid results. A Bid Tabulation Summary which summarizes the bids is attached.

The bids ranged in total price from \$79,991.00 to \$174,000.00. The Engineers Opinion of Probable Cost for the construction portion of this project was \$102,580 (inclusive of a 15% contingency). Each individual bid item in the apparent low bid was compared to the Engineers Opinion of Probably Cost to determine if any bid items appeared to be mathematically unbalanced. Based on our review, no bid items appear to be unbalanced.

GME also reviewed the supplemental information provided by J. Hutchins including the Bid Bond. It was noted that their bonding authority is significantly greater than the project's overall bid price and that the Bid Bond was valid and current. The Bond is underwritten by North American Specialty Insurance Company and the Washington International Insurance Company. Both are currently listed as certified bonding companies with the United States Bureau of Fiscal Services. Finally, there were no exceptions or special conditions noted in their bid.

J. Hutchins is located in the Town of Richmond. As you are aware, they recently completed the \$856,000 Bridge Street Infrastructure Replacement Project for the Town of Richmond. As it pertains to the Bridge Street project, from GME's perspective as an independent third party, J. Hutchins was professional, easy to work with, performed well and treated the Town fairly in all matters throughout the project.

It is GME's professional opinion that J. Hutchins, Inc. is the lowest qualified bidder for this project and has satisfactorily met the bid requirements outlined in the official Bid Documents. Based on our review, it is GME's recommendation that the Town of Richmond award the West Main Street Water Main Replacement Project to J. Hutchins, Inc.

If you have any questions, please feel free to contact us.

Sincerely,

GREEN MOUNTAIN ENGINEERING, INC.



Steven L. Palmer, P.E.
Project Manager



Alan Huizenga, P.E.
President

Copy: Kendall Chamberlain

Attachments:

1. Bid Analysis
2. Bid Advertisement
3. List of Interested Bidders
4. Individual Bids (10)

DESCRIPTION OF BID ITEM	UNIT	BID QUANTITY	ENGINEERS ESTIMATE		J. HUTCHINS		DEBISSCHOF		DESROCHES		FENOFF		COURTLAND		MUNSON	
			UNIT PRICE	TOTAL COST	UNIT PRICE	TOTAL COST	UNIT PRICE	TOTAL COST	UNIT PRICE	TOTAL COST	UNIT PRICE	TOTAL COST	UNIT PRICE	TOTAL COST	UNIT PRICE	TOTAL COST
4" Dia. PVC C900 Water Line	l.f.	450	\$80.00	\$36,000.00	\$60.00	\$27,000.00	\$68.25	\$30,712.50	\$95.00	\$42,750.00	\$60.00	\$27,000.00	\$51.00	\$22,950.00	\$78.00	\$35,100.00
3/4" Dia. Copper House Service	l.f.	70	\$85.00	\$5,950.00	\$72.00	\$5,040.00	\$78.00	\$5,460.00	\$73.00	\$5,110.00	\$55.00	\$3,850.00	\$113.00	\$7,910.00	\$84.00	\$5,880.00
3/4" Dia. Curb Stops and Boxes	ea.	7	\$600.00	\$4,200.00	\$235.00	\$1,645.00	\$485.00	\$3,395.00	\$300.00	\$2,100.00	\$530.00	\$3,710.00	\$154.00	\$1,078.00	\$710.00	\$4,970.00
4" Gate Valve	ea.	1	\$700.00	\$700.00	\$1,105.00	\$1,105.00	\$1,050.00	\$1,050.00	\$1,000.00	\$1,000.00	\$2,000.00	\$2,000.00	\$820.00	\$820.00	\$4,130.00	\$4,130.00
3/4" Dia. Corp Stops	ea.	7	\$600.00	\$4,200.00	\$243.00	\$1,701.00	\$495.00	\$3,465.00	\$200.00	\$1,400.00	\$300.00	\$2,100.00	\$255.00	\$1,785.00	\$130.00	\$910.00
8" x 4" Wet Tap (Millet St)	ea.	1	\$1,500.00	\$1,500.00	\$3,430.00	\$3,430.00	\$2,700.00	\$2,700.00	\$4,000.00	\$4,000.00	\$3,000.00	\$3,000.00	\$4,600.00	\$4,600.00	\$3,360.00	\$3,360.00
Blowoff Hydrant	ea.	1	\$500.00	\$500.00	\$3,550.00	\$3,550.00	\$3,170.00	\$3,170.00	\$5,000.00	\$5,000.00	\$1,000.00	\$1,000.00	\$5,000.00	\$5,000.00	\$3,900.00	\$3,900.00
Decommission and Abandon Existing Water System	ea.	1	\$2,500.00	\$2,500.00	\$2,000.00	\$2,000.00	\$1,950.00	\$1,950.00	\$1,000.00	\$1,000.00	\$1,500.00	\$1,500.00	\$1,680.00	\$1,680.00	\$3,100.00	\$3,100.00
Exploratory Excavation (test pits as necessary)	ea.	2	\$1,500.00	\$3,000.00	\$400.00	\$800.00	\$365.00	\$730.00	\$650.00	\$1,300.00	\$500.00	\$1,000.00	\$395.00	\$790.00	\$540.00	\$1,080.00
Gravel Road / Driveway / Pavement Removal	s.y.	65	\$10.00	\$650.00	\$16.00	\$1,040.00	\$15.00	\$975.00	\$7.00	\$455.00	\$5.00	\$325.00	\$12.00	\$780.00	\$20.00	\$1,300.00
Gravel Driveway Repair	s.y.	30	\$25.00	\$750.00	\$16.00	\$480.00	\$45.00	\$1,350.00	\$37.00	\$1,110.00	\$5.00	\$150.00	\$27.00	\$810.00	\$51.00	\$1,530.00
Bituminous Repair - Street	s.y.	25	\$100.00	\$2,500.00	\$80.00	\$2,000.00	\$120.00	\$3,000.00	\$115.00	\$2,875.00	\$80.00	\$2,000.00	\$83.00	\$2,075.00	\$133.00	\$3,325.00
Bituminous Repair - Drive's/Walks	s.y.	20	\$100.00	\$2,000.00	\$80.00	\$1,600.00	\$120.00	\$2,400.00	\$110.00	\$2,200.00	\$100.00	\$2,000.00	\$69.00	\$1,380.00	\$106.00	\$2,120.00
Repace concrete steps	l.s.	1	\$1,500.00	\$1,500.00	\$3,500.00	\$3,500.00	\$4,850.00	\$4,850.00	\$5,200.00	\$5,200.00	\$5,000.00	\$5,000.00	\$3,075.00	\$3,075.00	\$5,900.00	\$5,900.00
Overland Surface Restoration	s.y.	250	\$21.00	\$5,250.00	\$30.00	\$7,500.00	\$20.00	\$5,000.00	\$9.00	\$2,250.00	\$40.00	\$10,000.00	\$26.00	\$6,500.00	\$17.00	\$4,250.00
Rigid Trench Insulation	s.f.	200	\$5.00	\$1,000.00	\$1.20	\$240.00	\$2.00	\$400.00	\$4.00	\$800.00	\$2.00	\$400.00	\$2.80	\$560.00	\$2.60	\$520.00
Traffic Control	Hour	40	\$120.00	\$4,800.00	\$39.00	\$1,560.00	\$100.00	\$4,000.00	\$125.00	\$5,000.00	\$60.00	\$2,400.00	\$108.00	\$4,320.00	\$72.00	\$2,880.00
Erosion Control	l.s.	1	\$1,000.00	\$1,000.00	\$2,200.00	\$2,200.00	\$500.00	\$500.00	\$1,700.00	\$1,700.00	\$3,000.00	\$3,000.00	\$2,250.00	\$2,250.00	\$975.00	\$975.00
Mobilization/Demobilization	l.s.	1	\$10,000.00	\$10,000.00	\$12,200.00	\$12,200.00	\$5,500.00	\$5,500.00	\$7,000.00	\$7,000.00	\$23,000.00	\$23,000.00	\$25,000.00	\$25,000.00	\$13,500.00	\$13,500.00
Bonds	l.s.	1	\$1,200.00	\$1,200.00	\$1,400.00	\$1,400.00	\$2,822.50	\$2,822.50	\$1,800.00	\$1,800.00	\$1,000.00	\$1,000.00	\$2,000.00	\$2,000.00	\$1,000.00	\$1,000.00
Contingency (15%)	l.s.	1	N/A	\$99,200.00		\$79,991.00	\$83,430.00	\$83,430.00	\$94,050.00	\$94,050.00	\$94,435.00	\$94,435.00	\$98,863.00	\$98,863.00	\$99,730.00	\$99,730.00
Total Contract Price				\$102,580.00		\$79,991.00	\$83,430.00	\$83,430.00	\$94,050.00	\$94,050.00	\$94,435.00	\$94,435.00	\$98,863.00	\$98,863.00	\$99,730.00	\$99,730.00

DESCRIPTION OF BID ITEM	UNIT	BID QUANTITY	ENGINEERS ESTIMATE		ALL SEASONS		ORMOND BUSHEY		DIRT TECH		DUBOIS		AVERAGE	
			UNIT PRICE	TOTAL COST	UNIT PRICE	TOTAL COST	UNIT PRICE	TOTAL COST	UNIT PRICE	TOTAL COST	UNIT PRICE	TOTAL COST	UNIT PRICE	TOTAL PRICE
4" Dia. PVC C900 Water Line	l.f.	450	\$80.00	\$36,000.00	\$78.00	\$35,100.00	\$111.50	\$50,175.00	\$78.54	\$35,343.00	\$130.00	\$58,500.00	\$81.03	\$364,630.50
3/4" Dia. Copper House Service	l.f.	70	\$85.00	\$5,950.00	\$65.00	\$4,550.00	\$15.00	\$1,050.00	\$24.40	\$6,468.00	\$40.00	\$2,800.00	\$73.74	\$51,618.00
3/4" Dia. Curb Stops and Boxes	ea.	7	\$600.00	\$4,200.00	\$800.00	\$5,600.00	\$145.00	\$1,015.00	\$462.00	\$3,234.00	\$300.00	\$2,100.00	\$412.10	\$28,847.00
4" Gate Valve	ea.	1	\$700.00	\$700.00	\$1,400.00	\$1,400.00	\$623.00	\$623.00	\$1,010.63	\$1,010.63	\$1,200.00	\$1,200.00	\$1,433.86	\$14,338.63
3/4" Dia. Corp Stops	ea.	7	\$600.00	\$4,200.00	\$775.00	\$5,425.00	\$1,100.00	\$7,700.00	\$295.68	\$2,069.76	\$300.00	\$2,100.00	\$409.37	\$28,655.76
8" x 4" Wet Tap (Millet St)	ea.	1	\$1,500.00	\$1,500.00	\$3,000.00	\$3,000.00	\$1,655.00	\$1,655.00	\$5,544.00	\$5,544.00	\$25,000.00	\$25,000.00	\$5,628.90	\$56,289.00
Blowoff Hydrant	ea.	1	\$500.00	\$500.00	\$3,832.00	\$3,832.00	\$2,943.00	\$2,943.00	\$5,775.00	\$5,775.00	\$3,500.00	\$3,500.00	\$3,767.00	\$37,670.00
Decommission and Abandon Existing Water System	ea.	1	\$2,500.00	\$2,500.00	\$8,844.00	\$8,844.00	\$8,200.00	\$8,200.00	\$2,291.52	\$2,291.52	\$3,000.00	\$3,000.00	\$3,356.55	\$33,565.52
Exploratory Excavation (test pits as necessary)	ea.	2	\$1,500.00	\$3,000.00	\$1,400.00	\$2,800.00	\$500.00	\$1,000.00	\$997.92	\$1,995.84	\$3,200.00	\$6,400.00	\$894.79	\$17,895.84
Gravel Road / Driveway / Pavement Removal	s.y.	65	\$10.00	\$650.00	\$18.00	\$1,170.00	\$16.60	\$1,079.00	\$24.95	\$1,621.75	\$10.00	\$650.00	\$14.46	\$9,395.75
Gravel Driveway Repair	s.y.	30	\$25.00	\$750.00	\$26.00	\$780.00	\$51.50	\$1,545.00	\$167.16	\$4,864.80	\$5.00	\$150.00	\$42.57	\$12,769.80
Bituminous Repair - Street	s.y.	25	\$100.00	\$2,500.00	\$71.00	\$1,775.00	\$106.00	\$2,650.00	\$210.81	\$5,270.25	\$40.00	\$1,600.00	\$103.88	\$25,970.25
Bituminous Repair - Drive's/Walks	s.y.	20	\$100.00	\$2,000.00	\$54.00	\$1,080.00	\$110.00	\$2,200.00	\$203.33	\$4,066.60	\$40.00	\$800.00	\$99.23	\$19,846.60
Repace concrete steps	l.s.	1	\$1,500.00	\$1,500.00	\$5,653.81	\$5,653.81	\$5,200.00	\$5,200.00	\$7,756.33	\$7,756.33	\$3,500.00	\$3,500.00	\$4,963.51	\$49,635.14
Overland Surface Restoration	s.y.	250	\$21.00	\$5,250.00	\$16.00	\$4,000.00	\$32.00	\$8,000.00	\$10.98	\$2,745.00	\$20.00	\$5,000.00	\$22.10	\$55,245.00
Rigid Trench Insulation	s.f.	200	\$5.00	\$1,000.00	\$2.00	\$400.00	\$3.80	\$760.00	\$4.37	\$874.00	\$3.00	\$600.00	\$2.78	\$5,554.00
Traffic Control	Hour	40	\$120.00	\$4,800.00	\$39.00	\$1,560.00	\$45.50	\$1,820.00	\$274.43	\$10,977.20	\$100.00	\$4,000.00	\$96.29	\$38,517.20
Erosion Control	l.s.	1	\$1,000.00	\$1,000.00	\$1,950.00	\$1,950.00	\$1,600.00	\$1,600.00	\$2,467.36	\$2,467.36	\$2,500.00	\$2,500.00	\$1,914.24	\$19,142.36
Mobilization/Demobilization	l.s.	1	\$10,000.00	\$10,000.00	\$13,525.00	\$13,525.00	\$6,200.00	\$6,200.00	\$9,817.50	\$9,817.50	\$48,700.00	\$48,700.00	\$16,444.25	\$164,442.50
Bonds	l.s.	1	\$1,200.00	\$1,200.00	\$3,100.00	\$3,100.00	\$3,000.00	\$3,000.00	\$2,494.80	\$2,494.80	\$2,500.00	\$2,500.00	\$2,111.73	\$21,117.30
Contingency (15%)	l.s.	1	N/A	\$99,200.00		\$105,544.81	\$108,415.00	\$108,415.00	\$116,687.34	\$116,687.34	\$174,000.00	\$174,000.00	\$105,514.62	\$105,514.62
Total Contract Price				\$102,580.00		\$105,544.81	\$108,415.00	\$108,415.00	\$116,687.34	\$116,687.34	\$174,000.00	\$174,000.00	\$105,514.62	\$105,514.62

Notes:
 1. All Bids were mathematically verified. One insignificant rounding error was noted in Dirt Tech's bid resulting in a \$1.74 difference between their written bid total and GME's calculated Bid Total.
 2. The information tabulated above accurately reflects bids received by the Town of Richmond, February 5, 2021.