

January 26, 2021

Town of Richmond Attn: Selectboard PO Box 285 Richmond, VT 05477

RE: Dugway Road Improvements (at Huntington Gorge)

Recommendation to Award

Dear Selectboard,

On Tuesday, January 26, 2021, bids were due to the Town of Richmond for the Dugway Road Improvements project at the Huntington Gorge. Typically, I attend the bid opening and open the bids on behalf of the Town, however due to Covid restrictions I attended virtually through Zoom. Josh Arneson and Pete Gosselin opened all bids, while I checked the necessary criteria for submission and recorded bid prices. For reference, the bid process followed the FEMA procurement regulations, was publicly advertised, and twelve contractors submitted bids for consideration.

The total low base bid price, submitted by SD Ireland of South Burlington, Vermont, is \$305,350. This amount is less than the previously completed Engineer's estimate, however, is reasonable and competitive given the complexity of the scope of work. In addition to the base bid price, two bid alternatives were included in the bid documents – concrete coloring of the wall and a textured face. These requests were made by the Richmond Land Trust to enhance the aesthetics of the project. In return, Richmond Land Trust offered an easement (at no cost to the Town) for the construction of the improvements. Without the support of the Richmond Land Trust, the project would have been significantly more expensive. I recommend including both bid alternates (adder of \$18,600) to the project.

I completed a bid check and tabulation of all bids received to ensure the submissions were properly completed, the math on the bid form was correct, and all required documents were submitted. Due to the number of bidders, and for ease of reading, two bid tabulations were completed – one showing all contractors, a second showing only the lowest three bidders. The results of the bid check and tabulation show that SD Ireland submitted a responsive bid to the Town.

In addition to the properly submitted bid documents, SD Ireland has successfully completed many State and local highway improvement projects and is on the VTrans "Prequalified Contractors List" - they are a responsible/qualified bidder. Given that SD Ireland is both a responsive and responsible bidder, my recommendation is to award them the contract.



All original bid documents are with the Town for record keeping. Please contact me with any questions.

Sincerely,

Tyler Billingsley, P.E. Engineer / Owner

CC: Josh Arneson, Town Manager

Pete Gosselin, Town Highway

Bethany Cook (FEMA)

Attached: Bid Check Form

Bid Tabulation

Town of Richmond Dugway Road Improvements at Huntington Gorge Bid Check Form

Bids Due: January 26, 2021 at 9:00 a.m.



Contractor	Attended Mandatory PreBid Meeting	Addenda Acknowledge	Bid Bond	Signed Bid	Base Bid	Bid Alt 1	Base Bid + Alt 1	Bid Alt 2	Base Bid + Alt 1 & 2
Blow & Cote	Yes	Yes - 1,2	Yes	Yes	455,915.00	2,242.50	458,157.50	18,050.00	476,207.50
Dale E Percy	Yes	Yes - 1,2	Yes	Yes	391,000.00	12,870.00	403,870.00	4,180.00	408,050.00
ECI	Yes	Yes - 1,2	Yes	Yes	318,770.00	5,720.00	324,490.00	9,215.00	333,705.00
Manosh	Yes	Yes - 1,2	Yes	Yes	448,895.00	13,650.00	462,545.00	5,700.00	468,245.00
Goodhue Excavation	Yes	Yes - 1,2	Yes	Yes	388,221.00	12,707.50	400,928.50	4,097.18	405,025.68
Kings Trucking	Yes	Yes - 1,2	Yes	Yes	379,000.00	14,500.00	393,500.00	5,200.00	398,700.00
Munson Earthmoving	Yes	Yes - 1,2	Yes	Yes	559,295.00	13,260.00	572,555.00	4,275.00	576,830.00
GW Tatro	Yes	Yes - 1,2	Yes	Yes	352,651.00	13,780.00	366,431.00	4,750.00	371,181.00
DeBisschop Excavating	Yes	Yes - 1,2	Yes	Yes	318,970.00	12,740.00	331,710.00	4,085.00	335,795.00
Parent Construction	Yes	Yes - 1,2	Yes	Yes	467,300.00	5,200.00	472,500.00	11,400.00	483,900.00
SD Ireland	Yes	Yes - 1,2	Yes	Yes	305,350.00	9,100.00	314,450.00	9,500.00	323,950.00
JP Sicard	Yes	Yes - 1,2	Yes	Yes	447,525.00	2,210.00	449,735.00	6,650.00	456,385.00

*Notes:

^{1.} Kings Trucking did not fill in their total of all unit price bid items. The bid price shown above was calculated by the Town based on each unit price.

^{2.} Minor math errors were noted on the following bids: Blow & Cote, Goodhue Excavation, GW Tatro. The bid tabulation (attached separately) corrects these minor errors/variations. The bid prices above were as written by the Contractors on the bid forms and read aloud by the Town. None of the minor math errors changed the bid results.

Town of Richmond Dugway Road Improvements at Huntington Gorge Bid Tabulation - CONDENSED, LOW 3 BIDDERS Bids Due: January 26, 2021



				East Enginee	ring Estimate	E	CI	DeBisschop	Excavating	SD Ir	eland	Contractor Average		
Bid Item	Description	Unit	Est. Quantity	Unit Price	Extended Price	Unit Price	Extended Price	Unit Price	Extended Price	Unit Price	Extended Price	Unit Price	Extended Price	
1.0	Dugway Road Improvements	Oint	quantity	Onitinoe	11100	OHILTHOU	11100	Onici noc	11100	Omi i rice	7 1100	Onitine	11100	
1.1	General Conditions & Mob./Demob.	LS	1	\$55,000	\$55,000.00	\$43,600.00	\$43,600.00	\$32,900.00	\$32,900.00	\$22,000.00	\$22,000.00	\$48,321.92	\$48,321.92	
1.2	Site Demolition	LS	1	\$25,000	\$25,000.00	\$7,200.00	\$7,200.00	\$3,675.00	\$3,675.00	\$7,500.00	\$7,500.00	\$25,002.08	\$25,002.08	
1.3	Rock/Ledge Removal	CY	25	\$300	\$7,500.00	\$250.00	\$6,250.00	\$450.00	\$11,250.00	\$400.00	\$10,000.00	\$481.00	\$12,025.00	
1.4	Concrete Work													
1.4.1	Anchor Test	EA	3	\$2,000	\$6,000.00	\$1,445.00	\$4,335.00	\$900.00	\$2,700.00	\$1,500.00	\$4,500.00	\$1,171.75	\$3,515.25	
1.4.2	Anchors	EA	24	\$500	\$12,000.00	\$420.00	\$10,080.00	\$490.00	\$11,760.00	\$250.00	\$6,000.00	\$416.29	\$9,991.00	
1.4.3	Cast-in-place Concrete Footings	CY	70	\$1,300	\$91,000.00	\$580.00	\$40,600.00	\$817.00	\$57,190.00	\$800.00	\$56,000.00	\$845.13	\$59,158.75	
1.4.4	Cast-in-place Concrete Wall	CY	60	\$1,500	\$90,000.00	\$1,035.00	\$62,100.00	\$1,104.00	\$66,240.00	\$900.00	\$54,000.00	\$1,192.75	\$71,565.00	
1.4.5	Additional Reinforcing Steel	LBS	200	\$10	\$2,000.00	\$4.50	\$900.00	\$3.45	\$690.00	\$2.00	\$400.00	\$3.91	\$782.50	
1.5	Roadway/Embankment Earthwork													
1.5.1	Removal and Reuse of Existing Roadway/Embankment Materials	LS	1	\$60,000	\$60,000.00	\$52,300.00	\$52,300.00	\$34,475.00	\$34,475.00	\$48,000.00	\$48,000.00	\$57,238.33	\$57,238.33	
1.5.2	Additional Embankment Fill	CY	800	\$50	\$40,000.00	\$33.00	\$26,400.00	\$37.25	\$29,800.00	\$30.00	\$24,000.00	\$43.04	\$34,433.33	
1.5.3	Type 4 Stone Armoring	CY	200	\$75	\$15,000.00	\$64.00	\$12,800.00	\$68.00	\$13,600.00	\$75.00	\$15,000.00	\$87.88	\$17,575.00	
1.5.4	Roadway Reconstruction	LS	1	\$25,000	\$25,000.00	\$15,000.00	\$15,000.00	\$20,375.00	\$20,375.00	\$17,000.00	\$17,000.00	\$21,796.67	\$21,796.67	
1.6	Ancillary Work													
1.6.1	6" Underdrain (Ditchline)	LF	255	\$30	\$7,650.00	\$31.00	\$7,905.00	\$23.00	\$5,865.00	\$40.00	\$10,200.00	\$38.32	\$9,771.39	
1.6.2	6" Walldrain System (Retaining Wall)	LS	1	\$12,000	\$12,000.00	\$7,300.00	\$7,300.00	\$12,775.00	\$12,775.00	\$11,500.00	\$11,500.00	\$9,343.83	\$9,343.83	
1.6.3	Remove/Reset Existing Guardrail	LS	1	\$4,800	\$4,800.00	\$2,100.00	\$2,100.00	\$5,000.00	\$5,000.00	\$5,000.00	\$5,000.00	\$4,878.67	\$4,878.67	
1.6.4	Guardrail End Treatments	EA	2	\$2,500	\$5,000.00	\$950.00	\$1,900.00	\$1,200.00	\$2,400.00	\$2,000.00	\$4,000.00	\$1,094.67	\$2,189.33	
1.6.5	Site Restoration	LS	1	\$10,000	\$10,000.00	\$18,000.00	\$18,000.00	\$8,275.00	\$8,275.00	\$10,250.00	\$10,250.00	\$15,132.50	\$15,132.50	
	Total Base Bid Price				\$467,950.00		\$318,770.00		\$318,970.00		\$305,350.00		\$402,720.55	
A1	Alternate 1 – Concrete Color	CY	130	\$20.00	\$2,600.00	\$44.00	5,720.00	\$98.00	12,740.00	\$70.00	9,100.00	\$75.63	\$9,831.68	
	Base Bid + Alternate 1 Price				\$470,550.00		\$324,490.00		\$331,710.00		\$314,450.00		\$412,552.24	
A2	Alternate 2 – Concrete Formliner	SF	950	\$20.00	\$19,000.00	\$9.70	\$9,215.00	\$4.30	\$4,085.00	\$10.00	\$9,500.00	\$7.64	\$7,258.00	
	Base Bid + Alternate 1 & 2 Price				\$489,550.00		\$333,705.00		\$335,795.00		\$323,950.00		\$419,810.24	
							1			LOW E	BIDDER		1	

The information tabulated above accurately reflects bids received by the Town of Richmond on January 26, 2021.

1/26/2021

Tyler Billingsley, PE DEast Engineering, PLC Engineer representing the Town of Richmond

- 1. Kings Trucking and Excavating did not tally their item 1.0 bid price. This was completed by the Town and is shown for comparison purposes only.
- 2. Minor math errors were noted and corrected in the following bids: Blow & Cote, Goodhue Excavation, GW Tatro, . All were considered minor variations and did not change the outcome of the bid results.

Town of Richmond Dugway Road Improvements at Huntington Gorge Bid Tabulation Bids Due: January 26, 2021



			East Engineering Estimate		e Blow & Cote		Dale E Percy		ECI		Manosh		sh Goodhue Excavation		Kings Trucking		Munson Earth Moving		GW Tatro		DeBisschop	Excavating Parent Con:		nstruction	SD II	SD Ireland		JP Sicard		Contractor Average	
Bid Item Description		Est. uantity	Unit Price	Extended Price	Unit Price	Extended Price	Unit Price	Extended Price	Unit Price	Extended Price	Unit Price	Extended Price	Unit Price	Extended Price	Unit Price	Extended Price	Unit Price	Extended Price	Unit Price	Extended Price	Unit Price	Extended Price	Unit Price	Extended Price	Unit Price	Extended Price	Unit Price	Extended Price	Unit Price	Extended Price	
1.0 Dugway Road Improvements																															
1.1 General Conditions & Mob./Demob.	LS	1	\$55,000	\$55,000.00	\$42,500.00	\$42,500.00	\$51,938.00	\$51,938.00	\$43,600.00	\$43,600.00	\$30,000.00	\$30,000.00	\$13,500.00	\$13,500.00	\$5,000.00	\$5,000.00	\$85,000.00	\$85,000.00	\$23,625.00	\$23,625.00	\$32,900.00	\$32,900.00	\$49,800.00	\$49,800.00	\$22,000.00	\$22,000.00	\$180,000.00	\$180,000.00	\$48,321.92	\$48,321.92	
1.2 Site Demolition	LS	1	\$25,000	\$25,000.00	\$19,350.00	\$19,350.00	\$19,595.00	\$19,595.00	\$7,200.00	\$7,200.00	\$26,200.00	\$26,200.00	\$41,065.00	\$41,065.00	\$14,040.00	\$14,040.00	\$72,000.00	\$72,000.00	\$34,000.00	\$34,000.00	\$3,675.00	\$3,675.00	\$46,500.00	\$46,500.00	\$7,500.00	\$7,500.00	\$8,900.00	\$8,900.00	\$25,002.08	\$25,002.08	
1.3 Rock/Ledge Removal	СУ	25	\$300	\$7,500.00	\$2,350.00	\$58,750.00	\$495.00	\$12,375.00	\$250.00	\$6,250.00	\$400.00	\$10,000.00	\$250.00	\$6,250.00	\$80.00	\$2,000.00	\$475.00	\$11,875.00	\$202.00	\$5,050.00	\$450.00	\$11,250.00	\$100.00	\$2,500.00	\$400.00	\$10,000.00	\$320.00	\$8,000.00	\$481.00	\$12,025.00	
1.4 Concrete Work																															
1.4.1 Anchor Test	EA	3	\$2,000	\$6,000.00	\$1,450.00	\$4,350.00	\$2,245.00	\$6,735.00	\$1,445.00	\$4,335.00	\$1,500.00	\$4,500.00	\$800.00	\$2,400.00	\$500.00	\$1,500.00	\$2,000.00	\$6,000.00	\$621.00	\$1,863.00	\$900.00	\$2,700.00	\$600.00	\$1,800.00	\$1,500.00	\$4,500.00	\$500.00	\$1,500.00	\$1,171.75	\$3,515.25	
1.4.2 Anchors	EA	24	\$500	\$12,000.00	\$385.00	\$9,240.00	\$495.00	\$11,880.00	\$420.00	\$10,080.00	\$585.00	\$14,040.00	\$467.50	\$11,220.00	\$550.00	\$13,200.00	\$510.00	\$12,240.00	\$528.00	\$12,672.00	\$490.00	\$11,760.00	\$115.00	\$2,760.00	\$250.00	\$6,000.00	\$200.00	\$4,800.00	\$416.29	\$9,991.00	
1.4.3 Cast-in-place Concrete Footings	CY	70	\$1,300	\$91,000.00	\$1,325.00	\$92,750.00	\$787.00	\$55,090.00	\$580.00	\$40,600.00	\$875.00	\$61,250.00	\$742.50	\$51,975.00	\$750.00	\$52,500.00	\$800.00	\$56,000.00	\$1,125.00	\$78,750.00	\$817.00	\$57,190.00	\$840.00	\$58,800.00	\$800.00	\$56,000.00	\$700.00	\$49,000.00	\$845.13	\$59,158.75	
1.4.4 Cast-in-place Concrete Wall	СУ	60	\$1,500	\$90,000.00	\$1,785.00	\$107,100.00	\$1,120.00	\$67,200.00	\$1,035.00	\$62,100.00	\$1,120.00	\$67,200.00	\$1,056.00	\$63,360.00	\$1,250.00	\$75,000.00	\$1,150.00	\$69,000.00	\$1,193.00	\$71,580.00	\$1,104.00	\$66,240.00	\$1,000.00	\$60,000.00	\$900.00	\$54,000.00	\$1,600.00	\$96,000.00	\$1,192.75	\$71,565.00	
1.4.5 Additional Reinforcing Steel	LBS	200	\$10	\$2,000.00	\$10.00	\$2,000.00	\$3.50	\$700.00	\$4.50	\$900.00	\$6.00	\$1,200.00	\$3.00	\$600.00	\$3.50	\$700.00	\$4.00	\$800.00	\$4.00	\$800.00	\$3.45	\$690.00	\$1.00	\$200.00	\$2.00	\$400.00	\$2.00	\$400.00	\$3.91	\$782.50	
1.5 Roadway/Embankment Earthwork																															
1.5.1 Removal and Reuse of Existing Roadway/Embankment Materials	LS	1	\$60,000	\$60,000.00	\$25,750.00	\$25,750.00	\$39,120.00	\$39,120.00	\$52,300.00	\$52,300.00	\$39,280.00	\$39,280.00	\$62,000.00	\$62,000.00	\$140,000.00	\$140,000.00	\$72,700.00	\$72,700.00	\$27,635.00	\$27,635.00	\$34,475.00	\$34,475.00	\$120,600.00	\$120,600.00	\$48,000.00	\$48,000.00	\$25,000.00	\$25,000.00	\$57,238.33	\$57,238.33	
1.5.2 Additional Embankment Fill	СУ	800	\$50	\$40,000.00	\$32.00	\$25,600.00	\$41.25	\$33,000.00	\$33.00	\$26,400.00	\$88.00	\$70,400.00	\$35.00	\$28,000.00	\$30.00	\$24,000.00	\$73.00	\$58,400.00	\$43.00	\$34,400.00	\$37.25	\$29,800.00	\$44.00	\$35,200.00	\$30.00	\$24,000.00	\$30.00	\$24,000.00	\$43.04	\$34,433.33	
1.5.3 Type 4 Stone Armoring	СУ	200	\$75	\$15,000.00	\$45.00	\$9,000.00	\$75.00	\$15,000.00	\$64.00	\$12,800.00	\$125.00	\$25,000.00	\$87.50	\$17,500.00	\$32.00	\$6,400.00	\$283.00	\$56,600.00	\$80.00	\$16,000.00	\$68.00	\$13,600.00	\$60.00	\$12,000.00	\$75.00	\$15,000.00	\$60.00	\$12,000.00	\$87.88	\$17,575.00	
1.5.4 Roadway Reconstruction	LS	1	\$25,000	\$25,000.00	\$21,250.00	\$21,250.00	\$30,200.00	\$30,200.00	\$15,000.00	\$15,000.00	\$46,295.00	\$46,295.00	\$28,000.00	\$28,000.00	\$14,000.00	\$14,000.00	\$16,100.00	\$16,100.00	\$21,140.00	\$21,140.00	\$20,375.00	\$20,375.00	\$18,700.00	\$18,700.00	\$17,000.00	\$17,000.00	\$13,500.00	\$13,500.00	\$21,796.67	\$21,796.67	
1.6 Ancillary Work																															
1.6.1 6" Underdrain (Ditchline)	LF	255	\$30	\$7,650.00	\$45.00	\$11,475.00	\$35.40	\$9,027.00	\$31.00	\$7,905.00	\$71.00	\$18,105.00	\$28.43	\$7,249.65	\$32.00	\$8,160.00	\$36.00	\$9,180.00	\$39.00	\$9,945.00	\$23.00	\$5,865.00	\$44.00	\$11,220.00	\$40.00	\$10,200.00	\$35.00	\$8,925.00	\$38.32	\$9,771.39	
1.6.2 6" Walldrain System (Retaining Wall)	LS	1	\$12,000	\$12,000.00	\$8,855.00	\$8,855.00	\$15,905.00	\$15,905.00	\$7,300.00	\$7,300.00	\$9,805.00	\$9,805.00	\$4,150.00	\$4,150.00	\$3,500.00	\$3,500.00	\$9,200.00	\$9,200.00	\$6,536.00	\$6,536.00	\$12,775.00	\$12,775.00	\$18,600.00	\$18,600.00	\$11,500.00	\$11,500.00	\$4,000.00	\$4,000.00	\$9,343.83	\$9,343.83	
1.6.3 Remove/Reset Existing Guardrail	LS	1	\$4,800	\$4,800.00	\$4,775.00	\$4,775.00	\$4,625.00	\$4,625.00	\$2,100.00	\$2,100.00	\$11,240.00	\$11,240.00	\$4,201.00	\$4,201.00	\$6,800.00	\$6,800.00	\$3,800.00	\$3,800.00	\$3,903.00	\$3,903.00	\$5,000.00	\$5,000.00	\$4,600.00	\$4,600.00	\$5,000.00	\$5,000.00	\$2,500.00	\$2,500.00	\$4,878.67	\$4,878.67	
1.6.4 Guardrail End Treatments	EA	2	\$2,500	\$5,000.00	\$1,535.00	\$3,070.00	\$1,280.00	\$2,560.00	\$950.00	\$1,900.00	\$980.00	\$1,960.00	\$375.00	\$750.00	\$600.00	\$1,200.00	\$1,000.00	\$2,000.00	\$1,106.00	\$2,212.00	\$1,200.00	\$2,400.00	\$1,110.00	\$2,220.00	\$2,000.00	\$4,000.00	\$1,000.00	\$2,000.00	\$1,094.67	\$2,189.33	
1.6.5 Site Restoration	LS	1	\$10,000	\$10,000.00	\$9,850.00	\$9,850.00	\$16,050.00	\$16,050.00	\$18,000.00	\$18,000.00	\$12,420.00	\$12,420.00	\$46,000.00	\$46,000.00	\$11,000.00	\$11,000.00	\$18,400.00	\$18,400.00	\$2,545.00	\$2,545.00	\$8,275.00	\$8,275.00	\$21,800.00	\$21,800.00	\$10,250.00	\$10,250.00	\$7,000.00	\$7,000.00	\$15,132.50	\$15,132.50	
Total Base Bid Price				\$467,950.00		\$455,665.00		\$391,000.00		\$318,770.00		\$448,895.00		\$388,220.65		\$379,000.00		\$559,295.00		\$352,656.00		\$318,970.00		\$467,300.00		\$305,350.00		\$447,525.00		\$402,720.5	
A1 Alternate 1 – Concrete Color	СУ	130	\$20.00	\$2,600.00	\$17.25	2,242.50	\$99.00	12,870.00	\$44.00	5,720.00	\$105.00	13,650.00	\$97.75	12,707.50	\$111.54	14,500.20	\$102.00	13,260.00	\$106.00	13,780.00	\$98.00	12,740.00	\$40.00	5,200.00	\$70.00	9,100.00	\$17.00	2,210.00	\$75.63	\$9,831.68	
Base Bid + Alternate 1 Price				\$470,550.00		\$457,907.50		\$403,870.00		\$324,490.00		\$462,545.00		\$400,928.15		\$393,500.20		\$572,555.00		\$366,436.00		\$331,710.00		\$472,500.00		\$314,450.00		\$449,735.00		\$412,552.24	
A2 Alternate 2 – Concrete Formliner	SF	950	\$20.00	\$19,000.00	\$19.00	\$18,050.00	\$4.40	\$4,180.00	\$9.70	\$9,215.00	\$6.00	\$5,700.00	\$4.31	\$4,094.50	\$5.47	\$5,196.50	\$4.50	\$4,275.00	\$5.00	\$4,750.00	\$4.30	\$4,085.00	\$12.00	\$11,400.00	\$10.00	\$9,500.00	\$7.00	\$6,650.00	\$7.64	\$7,258.00	
Base Bid + Alternate 1 & 2 Price				\$489,550.00		\$475,957.50		\$408,050.00		\$333,705.00		\$468,245.00		\$405,022.65		\$398,696.70		\$576,830.00		\$371,186.00		\$335,795.00		\$483,900.00		\$323,950.00		\$456,385.00		\$419,810.2	
				. ,		See note 2.		. ,		. ,				L		See note 1.								L	LOW					4	

The information tabulated above accurately reflects bids received by the Town of Richmond on January 26, 2021.

Tyler Billingsley, PE
East Engineering, PLC
Engineer representing the Town of Richmond / 1/26/2021

Notes:

1. Kings Trucking and Excavating did not tally their item 1.0 bid price. This was completed by the Town and is shown for comparison purposes only.

2. Minor math errors were noted and corrected in the following bids: Blow & Cote, Goodhue Excavation, GW Tatro, . All were considered minor variations and did not change the outcome of the bid results.