

GREEN MOUNTAIN ENGINEERING, INC.

*1438 South Brownell Road
P.O. Box 159 Williston, VT 05495
(802)862-5590 (Fax)862-7598*

February 27, 2020

Mr. Josh Arneson, Town Manager
Town of Richmond, Vermont
P.O. Box 285
Richmond, Vermont 05477

RE: Bid Analysis and Recommendation for Contract Award
Richmond Bridge Street Infrastructure Replacement Project - Contract #1, DWSRF Loan # RF3-365
GME Project No. 19-002.7

Dear Mr. Arneson:

Green Mountain Engineering, Inc. (GME) is pleased to provide the Bid Analysis and Recommendation for Contract Award for the Richmond Bridge Street Infrastructure and Improvement Project. A pre-advertisement notification of the upcoming project was sent out on November 2, 2019 to the list of Disadvantaged Business Enterprises (DBE's) identified by the State as having experience in this type of construction. A formal DBE notification which included a copy of the Bid Advertisement was sent to the identified DBE's on December 2, 2019. The Bid Advertisement for this project was subsequently posted on Vermont Department of Economic Development's Bid system as well as Works in Progress on January 3, 2020. On January 17, 2020 GME provided a list of interested contractors and suppliers to the DBE's who had responded to GME and indicated that they were interested in this project. On January 18, 2020, GME mailed out Addendum #1 identifying all interested DBE's to the Bidders. Bids were required to be received by the Richmond Town Clerk's Office by 11am on February 14, 2020.

Bids were received from the following contractors:

1. J. Hutchins, Inc.
2. Desroches Construction Services, Inc.
3. Courtland Construction Corporation
4. All Seasons Excavating Inc.

All four bids were received by the Town of Richmond, Vermont Town Clerk's Office prior to the 11 am deadline on February 14, 2020. Each bid was time and date stamped at the time of submission and each envelope was sealed until officially opened. A public bid opening was subsequently conducted by GME at the Town of Richmond offices. Each bid submission was evaluated for inclusion of the following documents:

Mr. Josh Arneson
Page 2 of 3
February 26, 2020

- Completed Qualifications Statement including acknowledgment of Addendums 1, 2 & 3
- Signed Bid Form
- Inclusion of completed Bid Form Attachments 1, 2 & 3
- Inclusion of adequate Bid Security

Following verification of the required bid items, each bid was then read publicly aloud. At the conclusion of that process, an apparent low bidder was announced. The apparent low bidder was J. Hutchins, Inc. of Richmond, Vermont with a total bid price of \$735,529.00. A copy of J. Hutchins, Inc bid is included with this letter. A copy of the bid tabs for the other three bidders is also attached.

GME subsequently tabulated and reviewed each bid. Each bid was checked for completeness and mathematical accuracy of each individual bid item as well as the bid totals. All four bids were determined to be complete and there were no mathematical errors noted in any of the four bids. The bids ranged in price from \$735,529.00 to \$1,158,433.00. The Engineers Estimate for this project was \$735,949.00 making the apparent low bid within .06% of the Engineers Estimate. Each individual bid item in the apparent low bid was then compared to the Engineers Estimate to evaluate potential financial risks to the Town and determine if any bid items appeared to be mathematically unbalanced. Nothing in the four bids indicated that the bid items were unbalanced. However, GME recognizes some potential financial risk in Bid Item no. 10, "24' Steel Sleeve (Jack and Bore)". The bid price for this item from J. Hutchins was \$56,550.00 as apposed the Engineers Estimate of \$30,450.00. This price differential represents the largest single difference between the Engineers Estimate and J. Hutchins bid price for any single bid item. This is likely due to the difficulty of the installation and potential financial risk contractors perceive with this bid item should construction of this item not go as planned and/or unpredictable weather early in the construction season slows progress of this item. The Town shoulders some financial risk with this particular bid item. If the circumstance arises where the contractor hits refusal while installing the 24" casing, the Contractor would in all likelihood request a significant change order to move to a new boring location. GME is working with the Town to come up with contingency plans should this unlikely scenario occur. For this reason, however, GME recommends to both the Town and State that a 10% contingency be maintained on this project.

GME reviewed all supplemental information provided by J. Hutchins including the Bid Bond, proposed project personnel resume's as well as corporate financial information for J. Hutchins, Inc. J. Hutchins Bid Bond authority is significantly greater more than the project's overall bid price and the Bid Bond was re-issued on January 27, 2020. The Bond is underwritten by North American Specialty Insurance Company and the Washington International Insurance Company. Both are currently listed as certified bonding companies with the United States Bureau of Fiscal Services.

Resumes were reviewed for J. Hutchins proposed project team including the proposed Project Manager and Safety Manager. All have significant construction experience and in our opinion are qualified to manage this project.

GME reviewed EPA forms 6100-3 and 6100-4 for the Disadvantaged Business Enterprise Program as well as reviewing additional supporting documentation from J. Hutchins regarding their outreach to qualifying DBE's recommended by the State for this type of work. That information supports our conclusion that a good faith effort was put forward by J. Hutchins to reach out to qualified DBE's.

GME requested additional information from J. Hutchins, Inc pertaining to a list of similar projects that the

Mr. Josh Arneson
Page 2 of 3
February 26, 2020

company had successfully completed as well as professional references for the company. Based on that review, J Hutchins has sufficient experience in our opinion to successfully complete this project. GME also followed up on professional references provided by J. Hutchins including Mr. Zack Blodgette, City Engineer for the City of Montpelier, Vermont. J. Hutchins was hired by the City of Montpelier to construct a \$4,700,000 bike path including subbase, paving, drainage, culverts and incidentals. This is a 2-mile, multi-year project that is still in progress. Mr. Blodgette spoke highly of J. Hutchins and stated that the project has gone smoothly and that he would recommend them for other infrastructure projects. GME also contacted Mr. Brian Marcotte of Pinewood Manor, Inc. of Essex, Vermont. J. Hutchins conducted a \$640,000 infrastructure project for them consisting of water, stormwater, underdrain and roadway components for them. Mr. Marcotte stated that the J. Hutchins constructed a quality job, were easy to work with and that he would also recommend them for other similar projects.

Based upon our review, it is GME's professional opinion that J. Hutchins, Inc. is the lowest qualified bidder for this project and has satisfactorily met the bid requirements outlined in the official Bid Documents. Based on our review, we recommend that the Town of Richmond award the Bridge Street Infrastructure Improvement Project to J. Hutchins, Inc.

If you have any questions, please feel free to contact us.

Sincerely,

GREEN MOUNTAIN ENGINEERING, INC.



Steven L. Palmer, P.E.

Cc: Cinthia Parks, VTDEC Water Investment Division
Roger Bergeron, VTDEC Water Investment Division
Alan Huizenga, GME

Attachments:

1. Bid Analysis
2. DWSRF Eligibility Determination
3. J. Hutchins – Bid Package
4. J. Hutchins – Supplemental Bid Package Information
5. J Hutchins – DBE Information
 - A. EPA Form 6100-3
 - B. EPA Form 6100-4
 - C. DBE Correspondence)
6. Desroches Construction Services – Bid Tab
7. Courtland Construction Corporation – Bid Tab
8. All Seasons Excavating – Bid Tab